

**Environmental Health Sciences Research Center
Pilot Grant Proposal Evaluation (April 2012)**

Guidelines for Reviewers:

As a reviewer for an EHSRC pilot grant proposal, you will be responsible for:

- reviewing the attached pilot grant proposal in detail,
- making written comments with respect to the criteria listed on the Pilot Grant Proposal Evaluation Form,
- assigning an overall priority score as per NIH procedures (see below),
- and having your written findings available for review at the Pilot Grant Review Committee meeting.

Impact	Score	Descriptor	Additional Guidance on Strengths/Weaknesses
High	1	Exceptional	Exceptionally strong with essentially no weaknesses
	2	Outstanding	Extremely strong with negligible weaknesses
	3	Excellent	Very strong with only some minor weaknesses
Medium	4	Very Good	Strong but with numerous minor weaknesses
	5	Good	Strong but with at least one moderate weakness
	6	Satisfactory	Some strengths but also some moderate weaknesses
Low	7	Fair	Some strengths but with at least one major weakness
	8	Marginal	A few strengths and a few major weaknesses
	9	Poor	Very few strengths and numerous major weaknesses

Additional Information for Scoring Guidance Table
Non-numeric score options: NR = Not Recommended for Further Consideration, DF = Deferred, AB = Abstention, CF = Conflict, NP = Not Present, ND = Not Discussed
Minor Weakness: An easily addressable weakness that does not substantially lessen impact
Moderate Weakness: A weakness that lessens impact
Major Weakness: A weakness that severely limits impact

❖ Awards will be based on a relative ranking of priority scores (median value of all reviews); **with a priority score of 4.0 or better necessary to approve a project for funding.**

❖ A compiled summary of all reviewers' comments will be sent to each Principal Investigator along with notification of the decision of funding.

❖ Potential Conflict of Interest: Any reviewer who is involved in a pilot project application as an investigator should not take part in the review process for that application. Questions regarding this should be directed to Peter Thorne.